Bank credit and trade credit: The moderating role of financial constraints

Liem Nguyen^{1,2,*}, Anh Tran^{1,2}, Tien Pham^{1,2}, An Le^{1,2}, Thy Le^{1,2}, Viet Nguyen^{1,2}



Use your smartphone to scan this QR code and download this article

¹University of Economics and Law, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.

²Vietnam National University, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.

Correspondence

Liem Nguyen, University of Economics and Law, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.

Vietnam National University, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.

Email: liemnt@uel.edu.vn

History

- Received: 03-7-2024
- Revised: 06-9-2024
- Accepted: 27-9-2024
- Published Online:

DOI:



Copyright

© VNUHCM Press. This is an openaccess article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license.



ABSTRACT

Trade credit is an important source of financing, and its proper management is essential to the survival and thriving of firms. Meanwhile, bank credit also plays as a critical funding source, especially in the setting of developing and emerging markets with high level of information opaqueness and low institutional quality. The current research examines the determinants of accounts payable using a sample of 590 firms listed in Vietnam from 2015 to 2022, focusing on the choice between bank credit and trade payables. We utilize panel data estimation methods, including the fixed effects model (FEM) and the random effects model (REM). The study provides evidence supporting the substitution effect between banks' short-term and long-term loans and trade credit. Therefore, it is evident that many firms, when granted access to bank loans, exhibit a propensity to favor borrowing from banks rather than relying on accounts payable. The study differs from other similar studies by examining both short-term and long-term loans, rather than just short-term bank financing.

Furthermore, the analysis of the moderating effect of financial constraints reveals that firms that less financially constrained firms seek more bank credit than trade credit. Again, this emphasizes the priority for bank loans over supplier financing, as well as the role of bank credit in a bank-based financial market such as Vietnam. We also find that cash holdings, annual revenue growth rates and firm size are significantly related to trade credit use. The results are robust throughout several robustness checks and the effort to control for the potential endogeneity issue. Based on the research findings, we offer implications for relevant stakeholders on managing of external financing, including both bank and interfirm financing.

Key words: bank credit, trade credit, moderating effect, financial constraint

INTRODUCTION

² Firms need financial resources for their production 3 and investment activities. However, firms have dif-4 ficulties in sourcing their financial resources. In de-5 veloping countries, firms do not have many official 6 financing options ¹. The lack of financing options 7 induces firms in these economies to rely on credit 8 granted by banks and suppliers. In fact, bank debt and 9 trade payables collectively account for a fairly high 10 proportion of the balance sheet. 11 Bank credit is provided in various forms, ranging 12 from short-term loans, overdrafts, and invoice dis-13 counting, to long-term loans. The credit is granted 14 following creditworthiness evaluation based on nu-15 merous factors, including information from firms' fi-16 nancial statements to the lender. Meanwhile, trade 17 credit is provided by suppliers through payment ex-18 tensions (typically between 30 and 90 days). The lit-19 erature stresses that trade credit could be a helpful 20 source of funding in an environment plagued with in-21 formation asymmetry that compromises banks' abil-

 22 ity to properly evaluate creditworthiness properly $^{2-5}$.

Compared to banks, suppliers do not find information asymmetry a serious issue, since they make decisions based on the intimacy grown through the repeated behaviour of customers.

Choosing between trade payables and bank credit 27 is not always straightforward. Companies can meet 28 their financing needs with bank credit to keep financing costs low, provided it is available. They may turn 30 to trade payables when bank financing is inaccessible, 31 indicating a substitution effect between payables and bank credit^{2,6,7}. Alternatively, companies can adopt ₃₃ a diversification strategy, using both bank and supplier credit to maintain a mix of funding sources. This 35 way, they can rely on the other if one source becomes 36 unavailable. In this scenario, payables and bank debt 37 cover additional financial needs are covered proportionally, reflecting a complementary approach to financing^{8,9}. The extra cost of using both sources can 40 be seen as a premium to avoid financial constraints. Because of its specific nature of not belonging to the 42 banking sector, trade credit is not highly regulated by authorities. Trade credit is essential for entities 44

Cite this article: Nguyen L, Tran A, Pham T, Le A, Le T, Nguyen V. Bank credit and trade credit: The moderating role of financial constraints. Sci. Tech. Dev. J. - Eco. Law Manag. 2024; ():1-11.

45 facing challenges in accessing credit institutions and 46 capital markets ¹⁰⁻¹². However, payables can be an expensive source of finance for firms. García-Teruel and Martínez-Solano 13 document that UK firms face tradeoffs while using trade credit and in fact have a target level of accounts payable, and that larger firms with better access to alternative financing rely less on supplier credit. Abuhommous 14 also finds that Jordanian firms have a target accounts payable ratio. Luo 15 finds that the Covid-19 pandemic pressures firms that use account payables, so firms need to adjust to their target payable ratio even faster. Investigating whether the relationship between bank credit and trade credit is supplementary or substitutive is crucial. Furthermore, it is essential to find whether the financial constraint moderates the link

Investigating whether the relationship between bank credit and trade credit is supplementary or substitutive is crucial. Furthermore, it is essential to find whether the financial constraint moderates the link between bank credit and account payables. In other words, does financial constraint motivate firms to use both bank and trade credit, thus enhancing their complementary effect between them? Or, do less financial constraint motivate firms with easier access to bank loans try to take more on this source of financing, rather than supplier credit?

In Vietnam, the financial market is still fledgling with low institutional quality and weak corporate governance1. Therefore, creditors might hesitate to lend because of high information asymmetry and weak creditor protection. In this setting, the role of trade credit as a substitute for bank credit could be more substantial. At the same time, as firms have few financing options, the two financing sources could be used together to fill the financing gaps. Therefore, in a developing country with a bank-based financial market such as Vietnam, the link between the two types of financing remains complex, yet lacks empirical examination is lacking. In this research, we use a sample of listed firms in Vietnam from 2010 to 2022 to investigate the link between the two funding sources of funding to see which expectation is more realistic in this economy. We expand the literature by examining not only the link between short-term loans and payables, but long-term loans. Typically, long-term loans have not been studied in previous studies as both payables and short-term loans are more related to short-term operations. In our study, we build hypotheses to test the relationship between bank loans (including both short- and long-term ones) and trade payables to offer a more well-rounded view, at least in the context of a developing country as Vietnam. Finally, we also examine the other determinants of the use of trade credit to understand more comprehensively the na-96 ture of trade financing in this country.

After the introduction, the research continues as follows. Section 2 presents the literature review on which hypotheses are built. Section 3 presents the research methodology comprising empirical models, variable construction, and estimation strategies and research sample. Section 4 provides the estimation results and discussion, which we base on the implications in Section 5.

LITERATURE REVIEW AND HYPOTHESIS DEVELOPMENT

The relationship between bank credit and 107 trade credit 108

Bank loans have been identified as an important factor in both developed and developing countries ¹⁶. It is offered after creditworthiness evaluation based on the borrower's past performance. However, some level of information asymmetry exists between corporate insiders and outsiders, which limits banks' capacity to evaluate firms' creditworthiness ^{5,17} correctly. Firms plagued by information asymmetry often have difficulty obtaining bank loans, especially during financial crises.

This lack of bank credit may induce firms to consider trade credit as a substitute source of financing $^{18-20}$. In contractionary periods, suppliers generally have fewer difficulties facing information asymmetry due to the intimate knowledge about a regular buyer and the ability to repossess and redeploy the goods sold 21 . Hence, suppliers with low financing costs could provide the much-needed trade credit to financially limited purchasers to nurture a long-term relationship 12,22 . This phenomenon can be referred to as the "redistribution" effect.

Numerous studies have investigated the benefits of 130 trade credit. One of the primary advantages of trade 131 credit for purchasers is that the granted period buys 132 them time to evaluate the product's quality ^{13,23}. The ₁₃₃ buyer can decline payments if the faulty products re- 134 sult in decreased transaction costs. Obtaining trade 135 credit with favourable terms and conditions helps 136 lower overall borrowing costs ^{24,25}. Furthermore, ¹³⁷ firms can match their payments to suppliers with customer, eliminating the gap between cash inflow and 139 cash outflow. As a result, the cost of managing inventory would be reduced. Financially constrained firms 141 typically use trade credit to address excessive costs 142 and the unavailability of capital market funding aris- 143 ing from asymmetric information. Importantly, trade 144 credit is shown to help enable the survival of firms in 145 financial crises 22,26,27.

147 However, if firms do not make use of the early dis-148 count facility, trade credit can be an expensive source of financing ^{28,29}. High cost is the reason why firms 150 prefer short-term bank loans, and only when firms 151 cannot obtain more bank loans will they resort to trade credit, creating what is called a "pecking order" in the choice of financing sources.

Determinants of trade payables

155 Short-term bank loans

The firm's accounts payable level is influenced by its ability to secure external financing, including shortterm bank loans. Trade credit is generally more expensive than bank credit due to higher direct costs of funds 17,29. Consequently, firms with easy access to bank loans tend to rely less on trade credit. This aligns with the pecking order theory for short-term funding sources, where firms prioritize bank credit to minimize financing costs and only resort to trade credit when bank loans are not available. Furthermore, studies by Petersen and Rajan²⁹, Chen et al.⁴, Bussoli et al. 22, and Psillaki & Eleftheriou 7 provide evidence of the substitution effect, indicating a negative relationship between payables and short-term

On the other hand, firms may follow a financing diversification strategy, using both payables and bank loans to avoid the danger of funding sources drying up⁸. The diversification motive is further supported by Tsuruta 30, Lawless et al. 31 and Kestens et al. 32. The studies point to a complementary effect rather than a substitution relationship between trade payables and short-term bank loans. Despite the fact that trade credit demands additional expenses, firms may regard it as an "insurance premium". The diversification strategy might benefit firms with high levels of constraints 8,20. Trade credit helps to reduce liquidity risk³³ and alleviate financial difficulties during crises. Because there are reasons to expect both positive and negative links between accounts payable and shortterm debt, we establish the first two hypotheses as fol-

188 Hypothesis 1a: There is a positive association between short-term loans and account payables.

190 Hypothesis 1b: There is a negative association between short-term loans and account payables.

192 Long-term bank loans

193 Garcia-Teruel & Martinez-Solano 34 argue that com-194 panies with access to bank loans tend to exhibit re-195 duced reliance on trade credit, because trade credit is 196 more expensive than bank credit. This is consistent with the research results of Rodriguez-Rodriguez³⁵ and the findings of Petersen and Rajan 29 for small US 198 firms, which implies that firms that generate more resources internally tend to rely less on supplier debt. 200 Short-term loans are a more relevant determinant in 201 the case of payables, since accounts payable refer to 202 the funds owned by suppliers that have to be paid 203 within a year. However, since banks also provide 204 long-term debt, its effect on trade credit should also be 205 examined. Garcia-Teruel & Martinez-Solano 13 find 206 that long-term bank loans negatively relat to accounts 207 payable in Belgium, Finland, France, Greece, Spain, 208 Sweden and the UK.

Consequently, in this research, we use the same hypothesis regarding their linkage with trade payables 211 for both long-term and short-term loans.

Hypothesis 2a: There is a positive association be- 213 tween long-term loans and account payables.

Hypothesis 2b: There is a negative association between long-term loans and account payables.

Cash holdings

Although firms could delay the repayment to their 218 suppliers, trade credit obligations must be honored. 219 Late supplier credit payments result in costs, includ- 220 ing the price discounts, the likelihood of encounter- 221 ing late payment penalties and the resulting deterio- 222 ration in credit reputation ³⁶. Wu et al. ³⁶ uncover a 223 positive effect of trade payables on cash holdings in 224 China, with firms holding an additional \$0.71 in cash 225 for every \$1 of credit payable. Consistently, Abdulla 226 et al. ³⁷ consistently show that cash holdings positively 227 impact trade credit.

However, Chaieb³⁸ suggests that holding cash has a 229 negative and statistically significant effect on the cost 230 of debt. In other words, this implies that the higher 231 liquidity a company maintains, the lower its cost of 232 debt. In situations with substitution effect between fi- 233 nancial debt and account payables, firms are likely to 234 hoard more cash to reduce the cost of debt.

Consequently, since there are potentially two direc- 236 tions of the effect of cash holdings on trade payables, 237 we propose the following hypothesis:

Hypothesis 3: There exists a significant association 239 between cash holdings and account payables.

Size

Large and reputed firms are generally considered as 242 less risky, and tend to have superior financial condi-243 tions, access to loans, creditworthiness, and bargain- 244 ing power than smaller firms ^{23,34,39,40}. The size of the ²⁴⁵ buyer firm can impact the terms of trade credit. As 246

240

inclined to extend credit to large firms with favourable terms and conditions.

On the contrary, large firms could use less vendor credit, since they have better access to other sources of financing sources due to higher creditworthiness and reputation 41,42. Moreover, Atanasova 43 and Coricelli & Frigerio 44 argue that small firms suffer stricter credit limits and consequently rely on supplier credit as financial resources. If a substitution effect exists

247 a result, we can anticipate a positive correlation be-248 tween size and trade payables, as suppliers are more

ss mancial resources. If a substitution effect exists between bank credit and trade credit, we should witss ness a negative correlation between size and trade

payables.
Based on two potential opposite relationships, the hypothesis is proposed below:

263 Hypothesis 4: Size is associated with accounts 264 payable.

Fisman & Love 45 illustrate the utilization of trade

265 Inventory holdings

credit varies among industries but remains relatively consistent within industry. Industries, such as technology service firms and restaurants lacking tangible inventories, have a limited need for trade credit. This differentiates them apart from industries that heavily relying on tangible inventories 46. Inventories directly affect a firm's trade credit policy 47.

Naturally, Caglayan et al. 48 naturally find a positive correlation between trade payables and inventories, suggesting that firms tend to increase their inventories and trade payables when purchasing on credit from suppliers. Similarly, Cunat 49 and Yazdinejad & Jokar 50 identify a positive relationship between inventories and trade payables, arguing that firms with higher inventories tend to have higher trade payables

Therefore, a positive relationship between trade payables and inventories is anticipated.

since inventories can be collateral. Interestingly, Fer-

nandez et al. 51 document a negative relationship be-

Hypothesis 5: There is a positive relationship between inventory holdings and accounts payable.

289 Sales growth

tween the two factors.

Previous studies by Garcia-Teruel & Martinez-Solano 34 and Petersen & Rajan 29 provide a theoretical perspective, suggesting that firms with growth opportunities tend to seek more financing from suppliers, resulting in a positive correlation between sales growth and accounts payable.

²⁹⁶ Sales growth has a notable impact on trade ²⁹⁷ payables ⁵². Firms that are more vulnerable to

market imperfections are more likely to use more trade credit to manage growth. Cunat ⁴⁹ suggests ²⁹⁹ that fast growing firms can rely on trade payables when other sources of finance are not sufficiently available. Fisman & Love ⁴⁵ argue that industries that utilize trade payables grow faster in poorly developed financial markets.

We posit that obtaining more trade credit is necessary for firms to invest in projects with growth potential, especially in Vietnam, a relatively young financial market. As a result, we propose the following hypoth-

Hypothesis 6: There is a positive relationship between sales growth and accounts payable.

The impact of financial constraint on the 312 link between bank credit and accounts 313 payable 314

A firm's accessibility to bank credit is affected by its size and asset tangibility. Firms with more tangible assets may have greater access to external funds 53. large firms tend to have higher creditworthiness and better access to capital markets compared to small firms 41,42. Size and tangible assets can be regarded as factors that help firms benefit more from bank credit, thus increasing the levels of short-term debt. Therefore, firms with higher levels of size and asset tangibility should have better access to bank loans at better terms and conditions, thus being less financially constrained and reducing the need for trade credit.

The hypothesis is represented as follows:

Hypothesis 7: Financial constraints tend to increase the negative effect of bank credit on on accounts payable. 329

327

331

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Empirical model

The research employs the following baseline model to evaluate the hypotheses from H1 to H6: 333

The research employs the following model to evaluate $_{338}$ the hypothesis from H7: $_{339}$

```
Paya<sub>it</sub> = \beta_0 + \beta_1Size<sub>it</sub> + \beta_2Shortdebt<sub>it</sub> + 340

\beta_3Longdebt<sub>it</sub> + \beta_4Cash<sub>it</sub> + \beta_5Inventory<sub>it</sub> + 341

\beta_6Salegr<sub>it</sub> + \beta_6FC*Shortdebt<sub>it</sub> + \beta_7FC*Longdebt<sub>it</sub> 342

+ \beta_8FC*Cash<sub>it</sub> + \alpha_i + \varepsilon_{it} 343
```

Where: Paya is the dependent variable, measured as the ratio of trade payables to total assets 34,37. Size to the logarithm value of total assets 34,54. Shortdebt 346

is the main variable of interest, measured as the ratio of bank loans of less than one year to total assets.
Longdebt is another main variable of interest, measured as the ratio of bank loans of more than one
year to total assets 34,55 . Cash is the proxy for cash
holdings, measured as the ratio of cash holdings to
total assets 37 . Inventory is the variable representing
the level of inventories, measured as the ratio of total inventories to total assets 45,49 . Salegr is the annual growth rate of revenue 34,55 . FC is the financial
constraint variable, proxied by size and asset tangibility. The interaction variables formed between FC and
bank credit, and cash are included to evaluate the hypothesis H7. a_i is the individual effect, and ε is the
residual.

2 Research sample and estimation strategies

The research employs a panel dataset covering 590 firms listed in Vietnam from 2010 to 2022. The financial data are retrieved from the Thomson Refinitiv database. We remove firms with fewer than three years of observation due to extreme values are likely to be attached to these cases. The final data comprises 3,658 firm-year observations.

We employ panel data estimation methods, including fixed effects model (FEM) and random effects model (REM). As panel data have individual effects, these methods are more appropriate than Ordinary Least Squares (OLS). To further ensure the robustness of the research findings, we employ random effects with industry dummies to control for the characteristics of the industry on the tendency to use trade payables ⁴⁵. Finally, we try to address potential endogeneity issues emanating from the two-way relationship between the dependent and independent variables, in this case the choice between trade and bank credit could be simultaneously determined 56. All the models have been tested for the existence of problematic multicollinearity through the Variance Inflation Factor test⁵⁷. All the VIF values are lower than 4, indicating that the models are not subject to high level of 387 multicollinearity.

RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Descriptive statistics and correlation matrix

Table 1 presents the descriptive values of the variables in the model. Paya on average accounts for approximately one tenth of the total assets. Shortdebt's mean value is to somewhat similar to that of Paya, indicating that the two sources of financing might play equal roles in corporate capital structure. Longdebt

has a higher mean of 13.85 percent. Compared to Luu 397 & Nguyen 55, who examined listed firms in Vietnam 398 from 2011 to 2019, we have a similar value of Paya, 399 but a smaller value of Shortdebt and a higher value of Longdebt. This could be due to the effect of Covid-19 that makes long-term lending much more risky for 402 banks. 403

Cash is also close to Paya, with hortdebt and Longdebt values. Inventory, on average, accounts for one-fifth of the total assets. Salegr is not favorable, with a negative value of 0.2 percent. This could be due to the effect of Covid-19 outbreak that negatively affects the performance of firms in Vietnam.

Table 2 presents the pairwise correlation coefficients 410 of variables in the model. We can see that Shortdebt is 411 positively linked to Paya, while Longdebt is negatively 412 related to Paya. Cash is negatively related to Paya, sug- 413 gesting a substitution effect rather than the argument 414 that firms prepare cash to pay vendors. Large firms 415 tend to use less vendor financing, supporting substi- 416 tution effect. As firms have more inventory, they use 417 more trade financing to support the associated costs. 418 Overall, we can see evidence to support the dominating substitution effect, except for the positive corre- 420 lation between Paya and Shortdebt. However, it is 421 crucial to note that the correlation coefficients refer 422 only to the association between two variables, without 423 considering the other covariates, and this can easily 424 lead to biases in estimating coefficients. Therefore, it 425 is important to proceed with multivariate regressions 426 to verify the hypotheses established above.

Regression results and discussion

Table 3 displays regression results using the Fixed Effects model (FEM), Random Effects Model (REM), 430 REM with endogenous treatment (REM_endo), and 431 REM with industry dummies. As previously discussed, we make an effort to address the potential endogeneity issue emanating from the two-way relationship between the dependent and independent variables, in this case the choice between trade and bank 436 credit could be simultaneously determined 56 . We use the one-period lead value of Paya (Paya $_{t+1}$), rather than the current value of Paya, as the dependent variable.

From Table 3, Shortdebt is generally negatively and significantly related to Paya, suggesting that firms tend to consider the two sources of financing as substitutes. Trade credit is more expensive than bank credit ^{17,55,58}. Therefore, firms with easy access to bank loans rely less on trade credit to save funding costs for short-term needs ³⁴, in line with the hypothesis 1b.

Table 1: Descriptive statistics of the variables

Variable	Obs	Mean	Standard devia- tion	Min	Max
Paya	3,658	0.1093	0.1014	0.0000	0.9057
Shortdebt	3,658	0.1181	0.1462	0.0000	0.7638
Longdebt	3,658	0.1385	0.1606	0.0000	0.7981
Cash	3,658	0.1247	0.1288	0.0001	0.8828
Size	3,658	27.8336	1.5659	23.5902	33.9896
Inventory	3,658	0.2135	0.1757	0.0000	0.8589
Salegr	3,658	-0.0017	0.4986	-7.5548	1.0432

Source: author's calculation from research data

Table 2: Correlation matrix

	Paya	Shortdebt	Longdebt	Cash	Size	Inventory	Salegr
Paya	1.0000						
Shortdebt	0.1110	1.0000					
Longdebt	-0.1589	-0.3907	1.0000				
Cash	-0.1065	-0.1244	-0.1821	1.0000			
Size	-0.1265	0.0456	0.2189	0.0073	1.0000		
Inventory	0.1530	0.2934	-0.1689	-0.2062	-0.0066	1.0000	
Salegr	0.0422	0.0134	0.0539	0.0113	0.0512	0.0010	1.0000

Source: author's calculations from research data.

tis interesting to see that even though Vietnam is a young financial market with few financing options, firms still want to use less vendor credit, if they can use more short-term bank loans. This result also nullifies the diversification motive established in the research by Tsuruta 30 and Kestens et al. 32. Therefore, in Vietnam, firms tend to view bank credit and vendor credit as substitutes, rather than complements, and ignore the insurance premium effect.

the insurance premium effect.

With regard to Longdebt, we also find negative and significant coefficients in all four columns. Even though debt of longer maturity is not meant to support short-term financing needs, there is evidence of some substitution effect between long-term bank loans and accounts payable, supporting the hypothesis 2b. This result is in line with the study of Luu & Nguyen 55 in Vietnam. The findings for Shortdebt and Longdebt variables suggest that even though Vietnam is a market plagued by information asymmetry and low institutional quality, commercial banks, through their extensive networks and huge volume of credit granted, can squeeze information effectively.

⁴⁷¹ For the Cash variable, we also witness a negative rela-⁴⁷² tionship between cash holdings and accounts payable, in line with the hypothesis 3. This result negates 473 the view that firms prepare cash to pay trade credit 474 as in Wu et al. ³⁶ and Abdulla et al. ³⁷. Meanwhile, 475 Chaieb ³⁸ suggests that abundant cash helps lower the cost of debt, and while we document that there is a 477 negative linkage between bank loans and trade credit, 478 it is natural to expect that firms prioritize more debt in 479 their capital structure and hoard more cash to reduce 480 the cost of debt.

For Inventory and Salegr, these two variables are positively relate to Paya, consistent with the hypotheses 5 and 6. Caglayan et al. 48 find a positive correlation between trade payables and inventories, indicating that firms tend to rely on vendor financing to fund inventories. Cunat 49 identifies a positive relationship between inventories and account payables, arguing that firms with higher inventories tend to have higher trade payables as inventories can serve as collateral. Garcia-Teruel & Martinez-Solano 34 and Petersen & Rajan 29 provide a theoretical perspective, suggesting that firms with growth opportunities tend to gain more financing from suppliers, resulting in a positive correlation between sales growth and accounts payable. Growth opportunities are quite in-

497 tangible and usually cannot serve as collaterals; as a 498 result, firms might have to resort to the support from their suppliers, rather than banks to fund their expan-500 sion.

Table 4 presents the regression results for Model 2, i.e., Model 1 with interaction variables between financial constraints (FC) and bank credit. First, we use Size to guage the level of financial constraint. Compared to Model (2) suggested in Section 3, we remove the individual variables Size, Shortdebt and Longdebt, because the Variance Inflation Factor test indicates that including of these variables leads to serious multicollinearity among the regressors.

The results align with Table 3 for Cash, Inventory and Salegr. Specifically, Inventory and Salegr are positively related to Paya, indicating that firms with higher inventories and revenue growth rates tend to rely on vendor financing. On the other hand, if firms exhibit a stronger preference for bank credit than trade credit, they could hold more cash to reduce the cost of debt, 517 leading to a negative correlation between cash hold-518 ings and accounts payable.

Importantly, the interaction variables (Size*bank credit) have negative and significant coefficients. Larger firms tend to experience more substitution effects between bank credit and trade credit. This provides evidence supporting the hypothesis H7: for firms that are not less financially constrained, they will seek more bank credit, rather than trade credit. Increasing bank credit, especially short-term debt, could lead to bankruptcy risk; however, this risk is less problematic for large firms. At the same time, a higher level of bank credit might indicate that firms can access official financing at a favorable conditions. Previous studies also confirm that firms generally prefer bank credit, and only if bank credit is limited will they switch to trade credit ⁵⁵.

To complete the analysis, Table 5 presents the regression results for Model 2, with asset tangibility being used to indicate the level of financial constraint. Tang is measured as the ratio of the net value of property, plant and equipment to total assets. We find that the results are similar to those in Table 4. This again confirms the validity of the hypothesis H7: for firms that are not less financially constrained, they will seek more bank credit, rather than trade credit.

CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS

The current research examines the determinants of accounts payable of 590 firms listed in Vietnam from 2015 to 2022. Vietnam serves as an appropriate research setting since it is a developing country with 548 a young financial market plagued by information asymmetry and inadequate protection of the rights of 549 debtholders. In this setting, trade credit, or vendor financing, could be more significant role in providing 551 the much-needed funding for firms' operations.

Our study provides consistent evidence supporting 553 the substitution effect between bank loans and trade 554 credit, with bank loans being considered at short and 555 long-term maturity. In the context of Vietnam, it is 556 evident that many firms, when granted access to bank 557 loans, tend to favor borrowing from banks rather than 558 relying on accounts payable. This result is highly consistent with the previous results on the stronger preference for bank credit, and only when bank credit is 561 limited in contractionary periods would firms switch 562 to vendor financing. Further analysis of the moder- 563 ating effect of financial constraints reveals that firms 564 that are less financially constrained firms seek more 565 bank credit, rather than trade credit. Again, this emphasizes the preference for bank loans over supplier 567 financing in the context of Vietnam.

Based on the findings regarding the priority for bank 569 loans, the implications could be for suppliers to, per- 570 haps, provide more attractive offers to the buyer firms 571 or for the latter to take advantage of the discount provided through early payments. As for the banks, to 573 serve as the chief source of funds in the economy, 574 banks can collaborate with suppliers to utilize the information collected by the latter in the process of cred- 576 itworthiness verification. This would benefit both the 577 banks and suppliers.

Future studies can delve into moderating the effect of 579 other factors, like the country's governance. This avenue has not been exploited in the literature.

ABBREVIATIONS

FC - Financial constraint FEM - Fixed Effects Model **OLS - Ordinary Least Squares** REM - Random Effects Model TDNH – Tín dụng ngân hàng TDTM - Tín dụng thương mại

CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

Liem Nguyen is responsible for hypothesis development, data curation and regression estimation. Anh Tran is responsible for writing the introduction 596 and hypothesis development.

582

583

584

588

592

Table 3: Regression result of model (1)

	FEM	REM	REM_endo	REM_industry
	Paya	Paya	Paya(t+1)	Paya
Shortdebt	-0.161***	-0.123***	-0.0131	-0.132***
	[-12.77]	[-10.51]	[-1.01]	[-11.28]
Longdebt	-0.153***	-0.134***	-0.0406***	-0.140***
	[-13.92]	[-12.89]	[-3.49]	[-13.51]
Cash	-0.0887***	-0.0846***	-0.0344**	-0.0851***
	[-7.13]	[-7.19]	[-2.42]	[-7.28]
Size	0.0181***	0.00656***	-0.00421**	0.00903***
	[7.06]	[3.64]	[-2.16]	[5.04]
Inventory	0.0157	0.0351***	0.0226*	0.0467***
	[1.30]	[3.21]	[1.81]	[4.26]
Salegr	0.00724***	0.00757***	0.00456*	0.00729***
	[4.00]	[4.18]	[1.88]	[4.03]
Industry dummies				Yes
_cons	-0.347***	-0.0399	0.231***	-0.132**
	[-4.90]	[-0.80]	[4.29]	[-2.52]
No of observa- tions	3658	3658	2955	3658

Note: *, ** and *** indicate significant at 10, 5 and 1 percent respectively. The numbers in squared brackets are t-statistics.

Table 4: Regression result of model (2) - FC = Size

	FEM	REM	REM_ind	REM_ind_endo
	Paya	Paya	Paya	Paya(t+1)
Cash	-0.0849***	-0.0830***	-0.0828***	-0.0363***
	[-6.78]	[-7.04]	[-7.06]	[-2.58]
Inventory	0.0132	0.0338***	0.0450***	0.0392***
	[1.08]	[3.09]	[4.09]	[3.14]
Salegr	0.00768***	0.00780***	0.00763***	0.00473*
	[4.21]	[4.29]	[4.20]	[1.95]
Shortdebt*size	-0.00464***	-0.00388***	-0.00399***	-0.00102**
	[-10.71]	[-9.56]	[-9.89]	[-2.27]
Longdebt*size	-0.00489***	-0.00447***	-0.00454***	-0.00189***
	[-12.56]	[-12.27]	[-12.54]	[-4.67]
Ind dummies			[2.38]	[3.37]
_cons	0.152***	0.139***	0.120***	0.0929***
	[33.52]	[25.28]	[7.70]	[6.13]
No of observations	3658	3658	3658	2955

Note: *, ** and *** indicate significant at 10, 5 and 1 percent respectively. The numbers in squared brackets are t-statistics.

Table 5: Regression result of model (2) - FC = Tang

	FEM	REM	REM_ind	REM_ind_endo
	Paya	Paya	Paya	Paya(t+1)
Cash	-0.0903***	-0.0860***	-0.0879***	-0.0394***
	[-7.02]	[-7.13]	[-7.33]	[-2.76]
Inventory	0.00339	0.0194*	0.0308***	0.0316**
	[0.27]	[1.73]	[2.76]	[2.51]
Salegr	0.00686***	0.00702***	0.00674***	0.00435*
	[3.72]	[3.83]	[3.68]	[1.80]
Shortdebt*Tang	-0.124***	-0.0963***	-0.112***	0.000474
	[-6.04]	[-5.10]	[-5.89]	[0.02]
Longdebt*Tang	-0.148***	-0.126***	-0.140***	-0.0589***
	[-9.81]	[-9.61]	[-10.48]	[-4.02]
Ind dummies			[1.30]	[2.92]
_cons	0.140***	0.129***	0.133***	0.0983***
	[31.79]	[23.80]	[8.27]	[6.19]
No of observations	3658	3658	3658	2955

Note: *, ** and *** indicate significant at 10, 5 and 1 percent respectively. The numbers in squared brackets are t-statistics.

- 598 Tien Pham is responsible for writing the results and 599 discussions.
- 600 An Le is responsible for writing the results and discus-
- sions.
- Thy Le is responsible for writing the conclusion. Viet Nguyen is responsible for writing the conclusion.
- All members are responsible for proofreading the
- 605 manuscript.

REFERENCES

- 1. Vo XV. Foreign investors and stock price crash risk: evidence 607 from Vietnam. Int Rev Financ. 2020;20(4):993-1004;Available 608 from: https://doi.org/10.1111/irfi.12248. 609
- Bharath S, Dahiya S, Saunders A, Srinivasan A. So what do I get? The bank's view of lending relationships. J Financ Econ. 611 2007;85(2):368-419;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j. 612 ifineco.2005.08.003. 613
- Arca P, Atzeni G, Deidda L. The signaling role of trade 614 credit: Evidence from a counterfactual analysis. J Corp Fi-615 nanc, 2023;80:102414; Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/ 616 j.jcorpfin.2023.102414. 617
- Chen S, Ma H, Wu Q. Bank credit and trade credit: 618 619 Evidence from natural experiments. J Bank Financ. 620 2019;108:105616;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/ 621 i.ibankfin.2019.105616.
- Moro A, Fink M, Maresch D. Reduction in information asymmetry and credit access for small and medium-sized enter-623 624 prises. J Financ Res. 2015;38(1):121-43;Available from: https: 625 //doi.org/10.1111/jfir.12054.
- Huang H, Shi X, Zhang S. Counter-cyclical substitution 626 between trade credit and bank credit. J Bank Financ. 627 2011;35(8):1859-78;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j. 628 jbankfin.2010.12.009.

- 7. Psillaki M, Eleftheriou K. Trade credit, bank credit, and flight 630 to quality: evidence from French SMEs. J Small Bus Manag. 631 2015;53(4):1219-40;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/ 632
- 8. Andrieu G. Staglianò R. Van Der Zwan P. Bank debt and trade 634 credit for SMEs in Europe: firm-, industry-, and country-level 635 determinants. Small Bus Econ. 2018;51:245-64; Available from: https://doi.org/10.1007/s11187-017-9926-y.
- Ghosh S. Trade Credit, Bank Credit and Crisis: Some Empirical 638 Evidence for India? Margin. 2015;9(4):333-61;Available from: 639 https://doi.org/10.1177/0973801015596854.
- Beck T, Demirgüç-Kunt A, Levine R. Financial institutions and markets across countries and over time: the updated finan- 642 cial development and structure database. World Bank Econ Rev. 2010;24(1):77-92;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1093/
- McGuinness G, Hogan T, Powell R. European trade credit use 646 and SME survival. J Corp Financ. 2018;49:81-103;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcorpfin.2017.12.005.
- Yazdanfar D, Öhman P. Substitute or complement? The use of trade credit as a financing source among SMEs. Manag Res Rev. 2017;40(1):10-27;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1108/ MRR-06-2015-0153.
- García-Teruel PJ, Martínez-Solano P. A dynamic perspective on the determinants of accounts payable. Rev Quant Financ 654 Account. 2010a;34:439-57;Available from: https://doi.org/10. 655 1007/s11156-009-0124-0.
- Abuhommous AAA. Partial adjustment toward target accounts payable ratio. Int J Islam Middle East Financ Manag. 658 2017;10(4):484-502;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1108/ IMEFM-01-2017-0019.
- 15. Luo H. COVID-19 and trade credit speed of adjustment. Financ Res Lett. 2022;47:102541;Available from: https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.frl.2021.102541.
- 16. Ngo T, Le T. Capital market development and bank efficiency: 664 a cross-country analysis. Int J Manag Financ. 2019;15(4):478- 665 91;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMF-02-2018-

644

651

- 67 0048
- 17. Tang Y, Moro A. Trade credit in China: Exploring the link between short term debt and payables. Pac Basin Financ
 J. 2020;59:101240;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.
 pacfin.2019.101240.
- 18. Garcia-Appendini E, Montoriol-Garriga J. Firms as liquidity
 providers: Evidence from the 2007-2008 financial crisis. J Financ Econ. 2013;109(1):272-91;Available from: https://doi.org/
 10.1016/j.jfineco.2013.02.010.
- 676 19. Goto S, Xiao G, Xu Y. As told by the supplier: Trade credit and
 677 the cross section of stock returns. J Bank Financ. 2015;60:296 678 309;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2015.08.
 679 030.
- 680 20. McGuinness G, Hogan T. Bank credit and trade credit: Ev 681 idence from SMEs over the financial crisis. Int Small Bus
 682 J. 2016;34(4):412-45;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1177/
 683 0266242614558314.
- Fu K, Wang C, Xu J. The impact of trade credit on information
 sharing in a supply chain. Omega. 2022;110:102633;Available
 from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.omega.2022.102633.
- 887 22. Bussoli C, Giannotti C, Marino F, Maruotti A. Trade credit in
 688 Europe: Financial constraint and substitution effect in crisis
 689 times. Eur Financ Manag. 2023;29(1):327-48;Available from:
 690 https://doi.org/10.1111/eufm.12362.
- 691 23. Fabbri D, Klapper LF. Bargaining power and trade credit. J Corp
 692 Financ. 2016;41:66-80;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/
 693 j.jcorpfin.2016.07.001.
- 24. Aktas N, De Bodt E, Lobez F, Statnik JC. The information content of trade credit. J Bank Financ. 2012;36(5):1402-696
 13;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2011.12.
 001.
- 698 25. Giannetti M, Burkart M, Ellingsen T. What you sell is what
 699 you lend? Explaining trade credit contracts. Rev Financ
 700 Stud. 2011;24(4):1261-98;Available from: https://doi.org/10.
 701 1093/rfs/hhn096.
- 702 26. Gonçalves AB, Schiozer RF, Sheng HH. Trade credit and
 703 product market power during a financial crisis. J Corp Fi 704 nanc. 2018;49:308-23;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/
 705 j.jcorpfin.2018.01.009.
- 706 27. Coulibaly B, Sapriza H, Zlate A. Financial frictions, trade credit,
 707 and the 2008-09 global financial crisis. Int Rev Econ Fi 708 nanc. 2013;26:25-38;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.
 709 iref.2012.08.006.
- 710 28. Nilsen JH. Trade credit and the bank lending channel. J Money
 711 Credit Bank. 2002;34(1):226-53;Available from: https://doi.org/
 712 10.1353/mcb.2002.0032.
- 713
 29. Petersen MA, Rajan RG. Trade credit: theories and evidence.
 714 Rev Financ Stud. 1997;10(3):661-91;Available from: https://
 715 doi.org/10.1093/rfs/10.3.661.
- 716 30. Tsuruta D. Bank loan availability and trade credit for small
 717 businesses during the financial crisis. Q Rev Econ Financ.
 718 2015;55:40-52;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.qref.
 719 2014.09.004.
- 720 31. Lawless M, O'Connell B, O'Toole C. Financial structure and diversification of European firms. Appl Econ. 2015;47(23):2379-722
 98;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1080/00036846.2015.
 723 1005829.
- 32. Kestens K, Van Cauwenberge P, Bauwhede HV. Trade credit
 and company performance during the 2008 financial crisis.
 Account Financ. 2012;52(4):1125-51;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-629X.2011.00452.x.
- 728 33. Diamond DW. Debt maturity structure and liquidity risk. Q
 729 J Econ. 1991;106(3):709-37;Available from: https://doi.org/10.
 730 2307/2937924.
- 731 34. García-Teruel PJ, Martínez-Solano P. Determinants of trade
 732 credit: A comparative study of European SMEs. Int Small Bus
 733 J. 2010b;28(3):215-33;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1177/
 734 0266242609360603.
- 735 35. Rodríguez-Rodríguez OM. Trade credit in small and medium
 rize firms: an application of the system estimator with panel
 data. Small Bus Econ. 2006;27:103-26;Available from: https://

- doi.org/10.1007/s11187-006-0017-8.
- Wu W, Rui OM, Wu C. Trade credit, cash holdings, and financial deepening: evidence from a transitional economy. J Bank Financ. 2012;36(11):2868-83; Available from: https://doi.org/10.7411016/j.jbankfin.2011.04.009.742
- Abdulla Y, Dang VA, Khurshed A. Stock market listing and the use of trade credit: Evidence from public and private firms. J Corp Financ. 2017;46:391-410;Available from: https://doi.org/ 745 10.1016/j.jcorpfin.2017.08.004.
- Chaieb S. The Impact of Cash Holding on Debt Cost. Int J 747
 Econ Financ Issues. 2021;11(6):75-93;Available from: https:// 748
 doi.org/10.32479/ijefi.11738. 749
- Klapper L, Laeven L, Rajan R. Trade credit contracts. Rev Financ Stud. 2012;25(3):838-67;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1093/rfs/hhr122.

751

778

788

790

793

795

797

798

800

802

803

- Dass N, Kale JR, Nanda V. Trade credit, relationship- 753 specific investment, and product market power. Rev 754 Financ. 2015;19(5):1867-923;Available from: https: 755 //doi.org/10.1093/rof/rfu038.
- 41. Lin TT, Chou JH. Trade credit and bank loan: Evidence from 757
 Chinese firms. Int Rev Econ Financ. 2015;36:17-29;Available 758
 from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iref.2014.11.004. 759
- El Ghoul S, Zheng X. Trade credit provision and national culture. J Corp Financ. 2016;41:475-501;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcorpfin.2016.07.002.
- Atanasova C. How do firms choose between intermediary and supplier finance? Financ Manag. 2012;41(1):207-28;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-053X.2012.01183.x.
- Coricelli F, Frigerio M. Interenterprise credit and adjustment during financial crises: the role of firm size. J Money Credit 767
 Bank. 2019;51(6):1547-80;Available from: https://doi.org/10. 768
 1111/imch 12557
- Fisman R, Love I. Trade credit, financial intermediary development and industry growth. J Financ. 2003;58:353-74;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/1540-6261.00527.
- Niskanen J, Niskanen M. The determinants of corporate trade credit policies in a bank-dominated financial environment: The case of Finnish small firms. Eur Financ Manag. 2006;12(1):81-102;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1111/j. 777
- Bougheas S, Mateut S, Mizen P. Corporate trade credit and inventories: New evidence of a trade-off from accounts payable and receivable. J Bank Financ. 2009;33(2):300-7;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2008.07.019.
- Caglayan M, Maioli S, Mateut S. Inventories, sales uncertainty, and financial strength. J Bank Financ. 2012;36(9):2512-21;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2012.05.006
- Cunat V. Trade credit: Suppliers as debt collectors and insurance providers. Rev Financ Stud. 2007;20:491-527;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1093/rfs/hhl015.
- Yazdinejad EA, Jokar H. Discovering determinants of trade credit demand: Evidence from top managers insight. Cogent Econ Financ. 2019;7(1);Available from: https://doi.org/10. 1080/23322039.2019.1650611.
- Fernandes FDS, Guariglia A, Kontonikas A, Tsoukas S. Why do firms use trade credit? Evidence from Latin American firms. J Int Money Financ. 2022;120:102539;.
- Ferrando A, Mulier K. Do firms use the trade credit channel to manage growth? J Bank Financ. 2013;37(8):3035-46;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2013.02.013.
- Almeida H, Campello M. Financial constraints, asset tangibility, and corporate investment. Rev Financ Stud. 2007;20(5):1429-60;Available from: https: //doi.org/10.1093/rfs/hhm019.
- Ge Y, Qiu J. Financial development, bank discrimination and trade credit. J Bank Financ. 2007;31:513-30;Available from: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2006.07.009.
- Luu L, Nguyen L. Short-term debt and trade credit: Evidence on a nonlinear relationship. Cogent Econ Financ. 2021;9(1);Available from: https://doi.org/10.1080/23322039.

Science & Technology Development Journal – Economics - Law and Management 2024, ():1-11

2021.1975412.

- 810 56. Palacín-Sánchez MJ, Canto-Cuevas FJ, Di-Pietro F. Trade credit versus bank credit: a simultaneous analysis in European SMEs. 811
- 812 Small Bus Econ. 2019;53:1079-96;Available from: https://doi.
- org/10.1007/s11187-018-0101-x. 813
- 814 57. O'Brien RM. A caution regarding rules of thumb for variance inflation factors. Qual Quant. 2007;41:673-90;Available from: 815 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-006-9018-6. 816
- 817 58. Jory SR, Khieu HD, Ngo TN, Phan HV. The influence of economic policy uncertainty on corporate trade credit and firm 818 value. J Corp Financ. 2020;64:101671;Available from: https: //doi.org/10.1016/j.jcorpfin.2020.101671.



Nợ vay ngân hàng và tín dụng thương mại: Tác động điều tiết của hạn chế tài chính

Nguyễn Thanh Liêm^{1,2,*}, Trần Ngọc Vân Anh^{1,2}, Phạm Thị Kim Tiên^{1,2}, Lê Phan Ngọc Thiên An^{1,2}, Lê Việt Thy^{1,2}, Nguyễn Quốc Việt^{1,2}



Use your smartphone to scan this QR code and download this article

TÓM TẮT

Tín dụng thương mại (TDTM) là nguồn tài chính quan trọng và việc quản lý đúng đắn nguồn này là cần thiết cho sự tồn tại và phát triển của công ty. Trong khi đó, tín dụng ngân hàng (TDNH) cũng đóng vai trò là nguồn tài trợ quan trọng, đặc biệt là trong bối cảnh các thị trường đang phát triển và mới nổi có mức độ thiếu minh bạch thông tin cao và chất lượng thể chế thấp. Sử dụng mẫu gồm 590 công ty niêm yết tại Việt Nam trong giai đoạn 2015-2022, nghiên cứu này xem xét các yếu tố quyết định TDTM, tập trung vào sự lựa chọn giữa TDNH và TDTM. Chúng tôi sử dụng các phương pháp ước tính dữ liệu bảng, bao gồm mô hình FEM và REM, với các biến giả trong ngành. Nghiên cứu cung cấp bằng chứng ủng hộ mối quan hệ thay thế giữa các khoản vay ngắn hạn và dài hạn từ ngân hàng và TDTM. Do đó, công ty có xu hướng thích vay vốn từ ngân hàng hơn. Hơn nữa, phân tích về tác động điều tiết của các ràng buộc tài chính cho thấy các công ty ít bị ràng buộc về tài chính sẽ ưu tiên tín dụng ngân hàng hơn, thay vì TDTM. Điều này nhấn mạnh đến ưu tiên cho các khoản vay ngân hàng hơn tại Việt Nam. Ngoài ra, lượng tiền mặt nắm giữ, tỷ lệ tăng trưởng doanh thu hàng năm và quy mô công ty có tác động đến mức TDTM. Dựa trên các phát hiện nghiên cứu, chúng tôi đưa ra những hàm ý cho các bên liên quan có liên quan về việc quản lý tài chính bên ngoài, bao gồm cả tín dụng ngân hàng và tín dụng giữa các công ty.

Từ khoá: tín dụng ngân hàng, tín dụng thương mại, tắc động điều tiết, hạn chế tài chính

¹Trường Đại học Kinh tế - Luật, Tp. Hồ Chí Minh, Việt Nam

²Đại học Quốc gia Tp. Hồ Chí Minh, Việt Nam

Liên hệ

Nguyễn Thanh Liêm, Trường Đại học Kinh tế - Luật, Tp. Hồ Chí Minh, Việt Nam

Đại học Quốc gia Tp. Hồ Chí Minh, Việt Nam Email: liemnt@uel.edu.vn

Lich sử

- Ngày nhận: 03-7-2024
- Ngày sửa đổi: 06-9-2024
- Ngày chấp nhận: 27-9-2024
- Ngày đăng:

DOI:



Bản quyền

© ĐHQG Tp.HCM. Đây là bài báo công bố mở được phát hành theo các điều khoản của the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license.



Trích dẫn bài báo này: Liêm N T, Anh T N V, Tiên P T K, An L P N T, Thy L V, Việt N Q. Nợ vay ngân hàng và tín dụng thương mại: Tác động điều tiết của hạn chế tài chính. Sci. Tech. Dev. J. - Eco. Law Manag. 2024; ():1-1.